Ending Discipline Inequity in Ohio

The Kirwan Institute

Mikyung Baek, Senior Research Associate
Kelly Capatosto, Senior Research Associate
ABOUT KIRWAN

“We work to create a just & inclusive society where all people and communities have the opportunity to succeed.”
ABOUT KIRWAN

HOW KIRWAN APPROACHES OUR WORK

RACE AND COGNITION
The role of individual-level thoughts and actions in maintaining discrimination.

STRUCTURAL BIAS
The influence of our country’s racial history on policies, practices and values that perpetuate racial inequity.
WHY DISCIPLINE?
WHY DISCIPLINE?

1) Two-pronged disadvantage to students: academics, and push toward punitive systems (STPP)
1) Two-pronged disadvantage to students: academics, and push toward punitive systems (STPP)

1) Significant overrepresentation of students with marginalized identities; racial disparities
SUSPENSION AND STUDENT IDENTITY: NATIONAL ANALYSIS, 2014

Percentage of all students:

- White: 50.3%
- Black: 15.5%
- Boys: 51.4%
- Girls: 48.6%
- With disabilities: 11.7%
- Without disabilities: 88.3%

Underrepresented: 17.8%  23.2%
Overrepresented: 18.3%  13.2%
Students subjected to referrals to law enforcement or school-related arrests, by race and ethnicity

- Enrollment:
  - White: 51%
  - Two or more races: 3%
  - Hispanic/Latino of any race: 24%
  - Black/African American: 24%
  - Native Hawaiian/Other Pacific Islander: 31%
  - Asian: 16%
  - American Indian/Alaska Native: 1%

- Referrals to law enforcement:
  - White: 41%
  - Two or more races: 3%
  - Hispanic/Latino of any race: 24%
  - Black/African American: 24%
  - Native Hawaiian/Other Pacific Islander: 31%
  - Asian: 16%
  - American Indian/Alaska Native: 1%

- School-related arrests:
  - White: 39%
  - Two or more races: 3%
  - Hispanic/Latino of any race: 24%
  - Black/African American: 24%
  - Native Hawaiian/Other Pacific Islander: 31%
  - Asian: 16%
  - American Indian/Alaska Native: 1%
OHIO IS NO DIFFERENT
WHY DISCIPLINE?

1) Two-pronged disadvantage to students: academics, and push toward punitive systems (STPP)

1) Significant overrepresentation of students with marginalized identities; racial disparities
WHY DISCIPLINE?

1) Two-pronged disadvantage to students: academics, and push toward punitive systems (STPP)

1) Significant overrepresentation of students with marginalized identities; racial disparities

1) Opportune time in Ohio’s policy landscape
RE-DEFINING OHIO’S LEGACY:

“Zero tolerance” policy for “violent, disruptive or inappropriate behavior”

SB 246, the Supporting Alternatives for Education Act, proposes to limit suspension for young students. HB 410 states that students cannot be suspended, expelled or otherwise removed from school solely because they have been absent, even for unexcused absences.
ROADMAP

1. Defining the Problem: Bias-conscious policy framework

1. Research Strategies: School Discipline Equity Mapping

1. Next Steps: Discussion
   a. Public engagement: Make equity an explicit, measurable goal (not just a desired outcome)
Kirwan’s Existing Work

Education:
Black Students Suspected More Often Than Classmates

Ohio Discipline Data
An Analysis of Ability and Race

Research Highlight
Race Matters... and So Does Gender
An Intersectional Examination of Implicit Bias in Ohio School Discipline Disparities

Implicit Bias Strategies
Addressing Implicit Bias in Early Childhood Education

School Discipline Policy
Updates, Insights, and Future Directions

The Ohio State University
Kirwan Institute for the Study of Race and Ethnicity
Kirwan’s Existing Work

Kirwan Institute Policy Brief

Ending Racial Inequity in Out of School Suspensions

Mapping the Policy Landscape and Equity Impact

The Ohio State University
Kirwan Institute for the Study of Race and Ethnicity
A Kirwan Approach: Bias-Conscious Policy-Making

How Kirwan Approaches Discipline Inequities:

Race and Cognition

Holding individual schools accountable for biased discipline decisions (regardless of intent)

Structural Bias

Develop policies and practices that are equitable and just
A KIRWAN APPROACH: BIAS-CONSCIOUS POLICY-MAKING

1) Excessive Punitive Discipline
   a) ESSA focus on non-academic indicators of success
   b) Free and appropriate education (IDEA 2004)
      i) “Least Restrictive Environment” -- free from excessive discipline, exclusion from the classroom

2) Inequities
   a) Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964 prohibits discrimination based on race, color, or national origin in programs or activities that receive federal financial assistance
HOW DID WE GET HERE?

Variation in how policy is implemented

Lack of accountability for how individual schools feed into systemic inequity

Lack of benchmarks, measurable goals, and targeted interventions to address racial bias
What percent said yes?

“Through your professional lens, do you believe the policies and practice in your building are equitable?”

--2016 Survey Data of Education Leaders with Central OH School District 38 Respondents
VARIABILITY AT FRONTLINES

--2016 Survey Data of Education Leaders with Central OH School District 38 Respondents
Default Mode: Susceptible to Bias

- Time Constraints
- Compromised Cognitive Control
- High Ambiguity
- Overconfidence in Objectivity
Lack of Accountability

Discipline Policies are typically determined by this district’s code of conduct (unless otherwise stated).
NEED OF EXPLICIT EQUITY GOALS & BENCHMARKS

Disparate Treatment vs. Disparate Impact

Disparate Impact: “evenhandedly implement facially neutral policies and practices that, although not adopted with the intent to discriminate, nonetheless have an unjustified effect of discriminating against students on the basis of race.

--Obama Administration 2014 “Dear Colleague” letter on Discipline Equity:
NEED OF EXPLICIT EQUITY GOALS & BENCHMARKS

Disparate Treatment vs. Disparate Impact

Policy Landscape is Open: Research

Who:
Researchers, Policy-makers, Students, families, and Advocacy Groups

How:
What methods will we use to measure and evaluate progress toward equity?
Ending Discipline Inequity in Ohio

Out of School Suspension Equity Maps
USER EXPERIENCE

ArcGIS Ohio Schools, Out of School Suspensions 2016-2017

THE OHIO STATE UNIVERSITY
KIRWAN INSTITUTE FOR THE
STUDY OF RACE AND ETHNICITY
USER EXPERIENCE

ArcGIS: Ohio Schools, Out of School Suspensions 2016-2017

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Name</th>
<th>District Name</th>
<th>Class Type</th>
<th>Metro Area</th>
<th>Suspension Equity Metric (per 100)</th>
<th>All Students, Out of School Suspensions per 100</th>
<th>White, Out of School Suspensions per 100</th>
<th>Black, Out of School Suspensions per 100</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mifflin Alternative Middle School</td>
<td>Columbus City School District</td>
<td>Middle</td>
<td>Columbus, OH Metro Area</td>
<td>205.40</td>
<td>154.30</td>
<td>207.90</td>
<td>186.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jennings Community Learning Center</td>
<td>Akron City</td>
<td>Middle</td>
<td>Akron, OH Metro Area</td>
<td>189.80</td>
<td>95.70</td>
<td>81.10</td>
<td>205.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summit Academy Transition High School</td>
<td>Summit Academy Transition High School-Columbus</td>
<td>High</td>
<td>Columbus, OH Metro Area</td>
<td>163.90</td>
<td>187.90</td>
<td>92.00</td>
<td>255.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South High School</td>
<td>Columbus City School District</td>
<td>High</td>
<td>Columbus, OH Metro Area</td>
<td>161.90</td>
<td>121.90</td>
<td>51.30</td>
<td>143.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medina Middle School</td>
<td>Columbus City School District</td>
<td>Middle</td>
<td>Columbus, OH Metro Area</td>
<td>152.60</td>
<td>86.20</td>
<td>65.50</td>
<td>138.10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

THE OHIO STATE UNIVERSITY
KIRWAN INSTITUTE FOR THE
STUDY OF RACE AND ETHNICITY
USER EXPERIENCE

ArcGIS - Ohio Schools, Out of School Suspensions 2016-2017

South High School
USER EXPERIENCE

ArcGIS - Ohio Schools, Out of School Suspensions 2016-2017

Weinland Park Elementary
Data Sources

• School Discipline Data for SY2016-2017: Ohio School Report Cards (http://reportcard.education.ohio.gov/Pages/Power-User-Reports.aspx)


• Boundaries for Metropolitan Statistical Areas: TIGER/Line Geography Shapefiles, U.S. Census Bureau

• Percent of Non-White population: American Community Survey Tables: 2012-2016 (5-year estimates), U.S. Census Bureau
School Discipline Data:
Ohio School Report Cards
School Discipline Data:
Ohio School Report Cards
School Discipline Data: Ohio School Report Cards
Schools in Eight Metro Areas
Suspension Equity Metric

- Disciplinary actions data from Ohio Department of Education
  - Reports counts of discipline incidents (suspensions, expulsions, removal, etc.)
  - For all students and by racial groups
- Racial groups used: Asian, Black, Hispanic, Multiracial and White

- Suspension Equity Metric:
  - Difference in out-of-school suspensions between the highest disciplined group and the lowest disciplined group
  - Calculated for schools reported two or more racial groups
Suspension Equity Metric
Percent Non-White Population, an underlay
OTHER FEATURES: WEBMAP AND POPUP WINDOW
QUESTIONS & DISCUSSION